

# Culture and Communities Committee

10.00am, Tuesday, 12 September 2017

## Thundering Hooves 2.0: Council actions and annual health check

Item number	8.2
Report number	
Executive	
Wards	All

### Executive summary

---

The Council has made a commitment to support *Thundering Hooves 2.0: a Ten Year Strategy to Sustain the Success of Edinburgh's Festivals*, launched in 2015 and to evaluate progress through an annual 'health check' of the relationship between the Council and the 12 major Festivals.

This report summarises the progress made on implementing the Thundering Hooves 2.0 Action Plan and key findings, as well as key areas for development are set out in a Joint Agreement on Areas for Action following the annual health check meetings with Festival Directors. It is recommended that this report also be presented as a business bulletin item to the Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee.

## Thundering Hooves 2.0: Council actions and annual health check

### 1. Recommendations

---

- 1.1 To thank the Festival Directors and their staff, and Festivals Edinburgh colleagues, for the second set of annual health check meetings which informed this report;
- 1.2 To note the progress outlined in this report;
- 1.3 To note ongoing and future action set out in the Thundering Hooves 2.0 Action Plan Summary in Appendix 1;
- 1.4 To approve the Agreement on Action Areas as attached at appendix 2; and
- 1.5 To refer this report to the Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee Business Bulletin.

### 2. Background

---

- 2.1 The first *Thundering Hooves* study of 2006 led to a Thundering Hooves Action Plan which was implemented by Festivals Edinburgh, the 12 major Festivals, and partners including the Council.
- 2.2 Running in up to ten months of every year the Festivals, alongside major events, help make the city lively all year round; enhance residents' quality of life and cultural opportunities; attract significant numbers of national and international visitors to the city, along with the world's print, broadcast and online media. [Edinburgh Festivals 2015 Impact Study](#) confirms the huge contribution that Edinburgh's Festivals make to the quality of life, international reputation and economic vitality of Edinburgh and Scotland, including attracting audiences of more than 4.5 million and generating a net economic impact of £280m in Edinburgh and £313m in Scotland.
- 2.3 Additional resource has been identified, via the Thundering Hooves Steering Group, to allow the Festivals to deliver enhanced programming to celebrate the Festival City's 70<sup>th</sup> anniversary in 2017.

### 3. Main report

---

- 3.1 [Thundering Hooves 2.0: a Ten Year Strategy to Sustain the Success of Edinburgh's Festivals](#) (TH2.0) was published on 19 May 2015, and sets out six key themes with 38 recommendations for action, to ensure that Edinburgh retains its global competitive advantage. In considering a report on this topic on [18 August 2015](#), this Committee noted that it would receive a further report setting out recommended actions for the Council, as the basis for annual health check reports thereafter referring the findings to the Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee.
- 3.2 The first annual health check report was submitted to the Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee on [12 April 2016](#) and the Culture and Sport Committee on [8 March 2016](#). This report recommended action to improve support for the Festivals.
- 3.3 On [30 November 2015](#), this Committee approved the Council's new Culture Plan. The Culture Plan focuses on actions to be achieved in partnership, and acknowledges the vital contribution made by the Festivals with this action point: "Regularly assess and report to the Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee the Council's progress in leading and contributing to agreed actions within the Thundering Hooves 2.0 Strategy."
- 3.4 The Plan incorporates other actions that are designed to cover the Council's contribution to the TH2.0 Action Plan. The update on implementation of the Culture Plan was reported to the Culture and Sport Committee on 20 March 2017, [Culture and Sport Committee | The City of Edinburgh Council](#).
- 3.5 The most recent TH2.0 Action Plan Summary is set out in Appendix 1. Oversight of the TH2.0 Action Plan is maintained by the Festivals Forum, as well as cross agency Thundering Hooves Steering Group (Membership Link: [Festivals Forum](#)).
- 3.6 Steady progress has been made on a range of actions by the Council, working in partnership with Festivals Forum Partners as follows:

#### **Thundering Hooves 2.0: Review of Progress 2016-2017**

##### **3.6.1 Summary**

The following is a summary of current progress on areas for action to take forward the TH2.0 strategy, where the Council has a key role.

Overall, substantial progress has been made across many areas of the strategy. However, uncertainty and risk have increased in the strategic and operating environment for the festivals due to external economic and political conditions. In summary:

- Eight relevant action areas are on track;
- Two areas are under development; and
- Two areas are considered to be high risk, associated with the continuing challenges of identifying alternative funding mechanisms; and securing UK and international investment.

### 3.6.2 Action Areas at Risk

***Public funding settlements should recognise festivals' impacts; work to ensure that a solution is found to the proposed significant reduction in public funding, identifying new private sector investment streams***

- Additional one-off grant funding has been secured for 70<sup>th</sup> anniversary activities, and the recent in principle agreement by CEC and Scottish Government to co-fund the five year PLACE Programme (Platforms for Creative Excellence) has provided the first opportunity to address this recommendation. Meantime, however, the wider downward trend in recurrent core public funding continues. While grant reductions are in line with overall reductions required in public funding, they pose a risk for sustaining the global positioning of the Festivals into the next phase of their development beyond the 70<sup>th</sup> anniversary. Discussions among key funders and stakeholder organisations represented on the Festivals Forum are underway about the threats and opportunities and potential alternative funding and fiscal mechanisms.

***Identify key UK-wide and EU mechanisms to support the Festivals' ambitions and ensure they are embedded in wider UK and international bids***

- Through funding for Festivals Edinburgh, the Council has supported engagement with the GREAT Britain Campaign, VisitBritain, the Scotland Office and the UK Department for Culture, Media and Sport. Engagement focuses on making the case for the Festivals as a UK tourism, creative industries and soft power asset especially in light of the Brexit vote and looking for investment opportunities such as the UK Industrial Strategy. Festivals Edinburgh has provided evidence at Scottish and UK levels about the risks and impacts of Brexit and the need to replace and enhance the stimulus measures available to the culture sector as part of the planning for leaving the EU.

### 3.6.3 Action Areas under Development

#### ***Take a leadership role in influencing future infrastructure developments***

- The Council's City Region Deal planning has provided a focus for discussions on future infrastructure developments, and the Council intends to update the cultural infrastructure needs assessment in light of latest developments and proposals.

#### ***City of Edinburgh Council and others to develop an accommodation strategy***

- Affordability of accommodation for artists and audiences continues to be challenging in peak seasons. Early discussions have taken place with the Council's Economic Development service, Marketing Edinburgh and Scottish Enterprise to identify key issues and how the future development of accommodation capacity that matches the audience demographic of the festivals can be positively influenced.

### 3.6.4 Action Areas on Track

#### ***Establish formal structures to co-ordinate the festivals' needs across Council and Agency departments***

- The Council has concluded the Annual Health Check process for 2017 presented here. This exercise enables evidence to be gathered for troubleshooting across departments and identifying areas for strategic conversations about partnership working between Festivals and the City. A regular meeting schedule between Festivals Edinburgh, the Executive Director of Place and Director of Culture is now established.

#### ***Support the emerging strategy for Digitising the Festival City***

- A Task Group has been set up by the Festivals Forum to propose specific workstreams to implement the strategy, chaired by Scottish Enterprise and including representatives from the Council, the University of Edinburgh, Datalab, Scotland IS and Creative Scotland. Digital infrastructure is being considered as one of the strands under the leadership of the Council's Innovation and Futures Manager.

#### ***Take a leadership role in environmental issues, working across agencies to lead the drive to develop and promote Edinburgh as a Green Festival City***

- Festivals Edinburgh continues to support the Festivals to take a leadership role in environmental issues through a series of projects and events and close working with Creative Carbon Scotland. Key projects include helping Festivals to develop individual engagement events, promoting the Green Arts Initiative, presenting Edinburgh's

best practice at local, national and UK levels, and contributing as the only culture sector partner to the 'Edinburgh Adapts' action plan, which identifies and outlines climate change adaptation actions for the capital.

***Ensure social engagement activity across festivals is co-ordinated and works effectively with existing city structures***

- Work has been done in the past year on identifying opportunities to join up current engagement activity through sharing information across a Festivals Edinburgh Community and Education Working Group and involving existing city stakeholders including the Council's creative learning team and Edinburgh College. As a result, a joint approach to making the Festivals' offers more accessible to families, young people and schools is in development.

***Develop closer and deeper ties with an extended range of HE and FE institutions at Scottish and international levels***

- Festivals Edinburgh is now working with Edinburgh College as a partner in the pilot Festival City Volunteers scheme (see below) and is in discussions with academic leaders from across the University of Edinburgh about collaboration opportunities arising from their development plans. The Festivals have worked for several years as a partner with Edinburgh Napier University on their Festivals Management courses and bespoke training initiatives. Festivals Edinburgh, member festivals and the Director of Culture also contribute to the events and festivals management courses at Queen Margaret University.

***Ensure co-ordination of a cross-festival approach to training, apprenticeships and volunteering***

- Festivals Edinburgh has developed a proposed Festival City Volunteers scheme to enable a wide range of volunteers from across the communities of the city to participate in offering hospitality to city visitors and develop their confidence, skills and social engagement. The steering group includes representation from a range of Festivals, Volunteer Edinburgh, Edinburgh College and the Council's Employability Service and Localities team. Seedcorn funding has been provided by the Council as part of the Festival City 70<sup>th</sup> Anniversary programme, the pilot took place in August 2017. Proposals for a future strategy on skills development and apprenticeships have been made and discussions are underway with potential funders and with Skills Development Scotland.

***Promote ‘Edinburgh Festival City’ and formalise marketing planning between partners***

- Marketing Edinburgh and VisitScotland have both been in discussion with Festivals Edinburgh in recent months aimed at formalising and strengthening the joint approach to campaigns and partnerships.

***Work collaboratively on 70<sup>th</sup> anniversary programmes and create opportunities for investment***

- The Council have contributed £200,000 over three years, as part of the £700,000 collectively secured by the Thundering Hooves Steering Group partners to support the Festivals to capitalise on the 70<sup>th</sup> anniversary in 2017 and create opportunities to leverage this investment and create lasting benefits for the future development of the Festival City.

**Annual Health Check**

3.7 The Culture Service and Festivals Edinburgh have held the second set of ‘health check’ meetings with 11 of the Festivals to obtain feedback on their relationship with the Council. As previously reported to Committee on 23 August 2016, Edinburgh Mela Limited (EML) was not in a position to deliver a festival in 2016. A health check meeting has therefore not been undertaken.

3.8 Alongside the areas for action highlighted below, there was general positive comment about the Council’s grant support for the Festivals via the Culture Service as well as the practical and operational support received from service areas across the Council, particularly Public Safety.

**Awareness of the Festivals as key stakeholders in and contributors to the city’s success**

3.9 The commitment of the Council to the TH2.0 strategy and to supporting the festivals was welcome. It was noted that the Council has been a willing and proactive partner in many instances, and that there was scope to improve and develop further collaborative working. Some Festivals felt that their cultural, social and economic contribution to the city could be further disseminated and this will be considered including through Locality Teams. The Council’s ability to enable delivery of the Festivals through supporting services such as transport, waste management, licensing, public space provision was referenced at a strategic level but the health checks highlighted a need to coordinate these service connections following Council Transformation.

3.10 Whilst there was recognition that the Council needs to cover its own costs, there was a request for a partnership approach to charging and an acknowledgement of the economic benefits the Festivals bring to the city, as the current system is in danger of limiting ambition and inhibiting growth. It was suggested that this

could include exploring multi-year licensing 'by exception' for those Festivals going through the same process year on year, to reduce unnecessary risk.

- 3.11 The Festivals have come through strongly in the City Vision 2050 consultation as a defining asset of the city, and this has been welcomed by the Festival Directors. Given this strong support by citizens and stakeholders, it was felt that there is further scope for elected members and officials in leadership roles across the spectrum of the Council remits to develop their advocacy and ambassadorial role in relation to the Festivals, especially on a national and international level. It was also felt that the Culture Service could take on a further ambassadorial role for the Festivals within the Council, and that the Festivals would welcome the opportunity to engage more fully with the new administration following the election period. They were keen to see the Festivals championed by all elected members and senior officials going forward.

### **Working Together**

- 3.12 Suggestions for joint working in the coming year were requested in a number of areas, including:
- Licensing
  - Planning
  - Public Spaces Protocol
  - City Dressing
  - Roads and Parking
  - Waste
  - Council guidance and advice
- 3.13 As well as focusing on key Thundering Hooves objectives, key action areas for collaborative working have been pulled together into a Joint Agreement set out in Appendix 2.
- 3.14 The Executive Director of Place, the Director of Festivals Edinburgh and the Director of Culture have established a regular meeting schedule to address the Thundering Hooves Action Plan and areas of joint working as part of the annual health check. Appendix 2 sets out the agreed action areas and shared working practices.
- 3.15 With the recent appointment of Heads of Service to the Place Directorate it is anticipated that communication will be enhanced across key areas of joint working.
- 3.16 Officers across the Council will continue to contribute to the TH 2.0 Action Plan.
- 3.17 Due to the cross-Council nature of the issues being raised, it is recommended that this report be referred to the Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee.



## **4. Measures of success**

---

- 4.1 Shared agenda and programme of work developed in partnership between the Festivals, the Executive Director of Place and the Director of Culture (to include regular review of activity against the Agreement on Action Areas); better communication between the Council and the Festivals; greater understanding across the Council of the needs of the Festivals and how best to support these.
- 4.2 Continuing engagement across the Council and by the Festivals to support, develop and implement objectives from the Culture Plan;
- Ensure that everyone has access to world class cultural provision.
  - Support greater partnership working in the cultural and creative sectors and maximise resources available to help them thrive all year round.
  - Develop and support the infrastructure which sustains Edinburgh's cultural and creative sectors.
  - Invest in artist and practitioner development, and support and sustain the local artistic community.

## **5. Financial impact**

---

- 5.1 There is no direct financial impact from this report.

## **6. Risk, policy, compliance and governance impact**

---

- 6.1 There are no risk, compliance or governance issues arising directly from this report. This work is core to the Council's Culture Plan, and its support for the Thundering Hooves 2.0 strategy.

## **7. Equalities impact**

---

- 7.1 There is no direct equalities impact from this report.

## **8. Sustainability impact**

---

- 8.1 The impacts of this report have been considered in relation to the three elements of the Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009 Public Bodies Duties, and the outcomes are positive; supporting the Festivals helps to sustain the city's economic health and provides capacity building opportunities for residents.

## 9. Consultation and engagement

---

- 9.1 Meetings with 11 Festival Directors and Festivals Edinburgh have informed this report.

## 10. Background reading/external references

---

- 10.1 The most recent reports on the Council's annual Core Festivals and Events Programme were presented to the Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee on [24 January 2017](#) and the Culture and Sport Committee on [14 December 2016](#).
- 10.2 Thundering Hooves 2.0: 10 Year Strategy to Sustain the Success of Edinburgh's Festivals – Report to Culture and Sport Committee 18 August 2015 [Culture and Sport Committee | The City of Edinburgh Council](#)

### Paul Lawrence

Executive Director of Place

Contact: Lynne Halfpenny, Director of Culture

E-mail: [lynne.halfpenny@edinburgh.gov.uk](mailto:lynne.halfpenny@edinburgh.gov.uk) | Tel: 0131 529 3657

Contact: Lisa Kapur, Cultural Development Officer, Culture Service

E-mail: [lisa.kapur@edinburgh.gov.uk](mailto:lisa.kapur@edinburgh.gov.uk) | Tel: 0131 529 7988

## 11. Appendices

---

1. Thundering Hooves 2.0 Action Plan Summary
2. Agreement on Action Areas

## TH 2.0 Action Plan Summary - Related to City of Edinburgh Council - UPDATE AT JULY 2017

*This spreadsheet is colour coded to show the status of actions that fall due in 2017:*

*Green - underway and on track*

*Amber - underway with some delay or change against original baseline*

*Red - underway but with significant risk to achievement*

*Lilac - areas proposed for future focus*

TH2.0 Ref	Action
<b>3</b>	<b>The Festival City - experiences for audiences, artists, influencers and citizens</b>
	Take a leadership role in influencing future infrastructure developments
	Establish formal structures to co-ordinate the festivals' needs across Council and Agency departments
	City of Edinburgh Council and others to develop an accommodation strategy
	Promote new thinking around development and refurbishment of venues
	Support the emerging strategy for Digitising the Festival City
	Take a leadership role in environmental issues, working across agencies to lead the drive to develop and promote Edinburgh as a Green Festival City
<b>4</b>	<b>Deep and Wide Engagement - participation, learning and belonging</b>
	Ensure engagement across festivals is coordinated and works effectively with existing city structures
	Develop closer and deeper ties with an extended range of HE and FE institutions at Scottish and international levels
	Ensure co-ordination of a cross festival approach to training, apprenticeships and volunteering
<b>5</b>	<b>National and Global Positioning - branding, marketing and leadership</b>
	Promote 'Edinburgh Festival City' and formalise marketing planning between partners
	Work collaboratively on 70 <sup>th</sup> anniversary programmes and create opportunities for investment

TH2.0 Ref	Action
<b>6</b>	<b>Digital Ways and Means - to connect and create</b>
	City of Edinburgh Council to scope a joined-up digital infrastructure strategy for the city
<b>7</b>	<b>Investment and Enterprise - sustainability, growth and innovation</b>
	Public funding settlements should recognise and reflect the social, cultural and economic impact of Edinburgh's 12 major festivals
	Maintain core and project funding whilst alternative funding models considered
	Identify key UK-wide and EU mechanisms to support the Festivals' ambitions and ensure that they are pursued.
	Ensure that the festivals needs and ambitions are embedded in wider UK and international bids for support and international frameworks
	Consolidate a joined-up national Scottish approach to supporting the needs and ambitions of Edinburgh's festivals across Scottish Government Departments and the public agencies with a national remit through the work of the Festival Forum
	Work with the tourism sector, the wider city business community, City of Edinburgh Council, the Scottish Government and key agencies to ensure that a solution is found to the proposed significant reduction in public funding, identifying new private sector investment streams for the investment priorities
	Work together on a range of fundraising and enterprise initiatives

## **CITY OF EDINBURGH COUNCIL AND FESTIVALS EDINBURGH: JOINT AGREEMENT ON AREAS FOR ACTION**

### **Background**

1. The world renowned Festivals are one of Edinburgh's unique assets. Collectively, they ensure that the cultural, economic and international strengths of the city are recognised across the globe, and they offer a key platform to benefit the citizens and the economy of Edinburgh, Scotland and the UK.
2. This agreement recognises the compact that exists between the City of Edinburgh Council and Edinburgh's major Festivals. The support that the City provides to the Festivals has proved a highly effective route to growing the city's creativity and economy. The latest economic impact study from 2015 shows that the Festivals in return generate a multiplier effect of 67:1 for the city's financial investment, enabling them to develop local livelihoods and artists' careers while also offering national and international platforms for top homegrown talent.
3. Addressing the priorities set out here will help ensure that the conditions are in place for sustained growth, and that the potential of the Festivals can be realised in playing a leadership role for Edinburgh, Scotland and the UK and delivering the benefits of culture-led development.

### **Purpose**

4. The purpose of this joint agreement is to identify key shared priorities for action in the immediate and longer term for the City of Edinburgh Council (CEC), the Edinburgh Festivals (the Festivals), and their collective development body Festivals Edinburgh (FE). These are common areas of interest both to individual Festivals and to the overall success of the Festival City. Each Festival will work with CEC on those issues of relevance to them, and where appropriate the Festivals will agree joint action, through Festivals Edinburgh, to take issues forward together. Inclusion of an area in this agreement does not in any way take the place of individual Festivals working with CEC and other key city players, as Festivals Edinburgh exists to complement and not replace the role of the Festivals themselves.
5. Developing and communicating this joint agreement will help ensure that the City of Edinburgh Council, Edinburgh's Festivals and Festivals Edinburgh collectively are strongly connected and working effectively to co-ordinate action through all available mechanisms to address the priorities identified below.
6. This document summarises our joint aims in strengthening the City's cultural and tourism offer, and notes the wide range of other partners and stakeholders involved including the organisations and individuals who are members of the Festivals Forum, Edinburgh's Culture Task Group and the Edinburgh Cultural Venues Group.

### **Shared aims**

7. As set out in Thundering Hooves 2.0 agreed by key stakeholders including Festivals Edinburgh and the City of Edinburgh Council, our joint aims are to sustain the success of Edinburgh's Festivals and the Festival City through:
  - ensuring the city's infrastructure and operations can evolve to continue to provide an unrivalled experience for its citizens, and the artists, audiences and opinion formers from across the world;
  - collaborating to support educational aims and social justice through participation, learning and belonging;
  - forging strong international partnerships to give the city a voice on the world stage;

- embracing new technologies to offer new ways to experience the festivals as well as new means of creation and international brand building;
- identifying new forms of funding and business models to secure the sustainability and growth of the Festivals.

### **Desired outcomes**

8. Working together on the joint priorities below will help to create the conditions for the City and the Festivals to work towards the following desired outcomes for the future:
- Sustainable Festivals with the ability to fund and produce world-class programming that maintains the value of Edinburgh's cultural assets and enables the creation of economic and social value
  - Modern infrastructure, physical and digital, maintaining Edinburgh's attractiveness as a cultural capital
  - High quality city environment, reflecting the city's premier status as a world class place to live, work, study and visit
  - Strengthened cultural offers that maximise use of the Festivals' infrastructure and expertise to grow tourism and employment opportunities
  - Growth in Edinburgh's creative community and creative economy, supported by the capacity building role of Edinburgh's Festivals
  - Increased skills for young people through the platform offered by Edinburgh's Festivals
  - Improved opportunities for communities across the city to benefit from the cultural, social and economic impacts of the Festivals.

### **Joint priorities for immediate action**

9. The following areas are operational priorities for joint action in the coming months:

#### **A. Buildings**

- FE to facilitate the Festivals to bring our collective insights together to help shape a route map for the development of the city's cultural infrastructure
- FE to facilitate the Festivals to contribute our knowledge to help create a hotmap of spaces available for cultural purposes across the city

#### **B. Public spaces**

- CEC to secure individual Festivals' input to the city's public space manifesto, with support from FE, to develop guidelines for a co-production approach to use of key spaces
- CEC and the Festivals to agree to share knowledge on effective approaches to good neighbourhood management, promoting a positive festival city environment for residents and visitors, facilitated by FE where appropriate
- CEC to agree to build in a cultural perspective to planning future area developments, to ensure that the city's cultural offer is enhanced for the long term

#### **C. Live performance**

- The Festivals and CEC to participate in the development of a new approach to city music licensing to support local talent, festivals and venues, as well as the programming of the Festivals, facilitated by FE where appropriate

**D. Digital infrastructure**

- CEC, the Festivals and FE to work together to develop the city's plans for world class digital infrastructure facilities to animate the public realm, creating new opportunities for citizens and visitors to connect with the city and each other

**E. Environmental sustainability**

- The Festivals, FE and CEC to take action on our shared commitment to embed environmental practice, widen sustainability engagement and minimise avoidable carbon emissions, in order to develop Edinburgh as a Green Festival City.

**Joint strategic priorities**

10. The priorities below are longer term strategic issues where we will prioritise continuing joint action:

**F. Creative economy**

- FE and CEC to increase understanding of the Festivals' impacts through mapping the interactions with wider cultural, tech and service sector clusters locally, nationally and internationally;
- The Festivals, FE and CEC to support engagement to maximise the mutual benefits of cross-fertilisation of skills, ideas and resources.

**G. City communities**

- FE and CEC to increase understanding of the Festivals' impacts through mapping the interactions with the city's diverse communities including through education activities;
- The Festivals, FE and CEC to support engagement to maximise the mutual benefits of cross-fertilisation of skills, ideas and resources.

**H. Financial sustainability**

- Facilitated by FE, CEC to work with the Festivals to ensure that the shared commitment to the importance of Festivals and culture to the city, as set out in Thundering Hooves 2.0, is embedded in policy making around maintaining core and project funding at the maximum possible levels, while developing alternative funding mechanisms for sustaining the success of Festivals in the city.

**Taking this agreement forward**

11. In taking this agreement forward:
- FE and CEC will ensure there is regular structured partnership working to support the delivery of the aims and priorities in this Agreement.
  - Both parties will identify a contact point to take the lead in each priority area.
  - We will meet formally four times a year to review progress against the joint aims and priorities and plan for the period ahead.
  - This Agreement will run for 12 months in the first instance from the last date of signature.
  - At the end of this period we will review the effectiveness of the Agreement in focusing our work together and decide on the best framework for taking actions forward in the longer term.

**Signatories:**

Julia Amour  
Director  
Festivals Edinburgh

Date:

Paul Lawrence  
Executive Director of Place  
City of Edinburgh Council

Date:

Councillor Donald Wilson  
Convener, Culture and  
Communities Committee  
City of Edinburgh Council

Date:

